

CATHEDRAL AREA COMMUNITY ASSOCIATION

2900 - 13th Ave, Regina SK, S4T 1N7 . 306.569.8755 . CACA@sasktel.net

Aug 20, 2020

Cathedral Area Community Association
Request to submit to the City Council Meeting of August 25, 2020
re. Demolition of the Bagshaw Residence 56 Angus Crescent

Submitted by Patricia Elliott, on behalf of the CACA Planning Advisory Committee

To his worship the Mayor and members of City Council,

Attached is a copy of the Cathedral Area Community Association's letter to City Planning, which we spoke to at the last Regina Planning Commission meeting. To this document we would add the following considerations, based on information and discussion raised at the Commission meeting.

Street Impact

In its submission provided to the Commission, the provincial government stated its concern that allowing demolition of the Bagshaw Residence may tip off a series of demolitions of homes on Angus Crescent that have no protection, creating a 'sawtooth' effect. This would have a permanent negative impact on one of Regina's most historic streetscapes. This phenomenon has occurred on other streets in our neighbourhood, with an attendant loss of green space, mature trees and affordable entry-level older homes. Thus it is not just historic spaces that become threatened but also our neighbourhood's socio-economic diversity and carbon footprint mitigation.

For some years now, the City of Regina has been raising the idea of creating a heritage conservation district that would include the Cathedral Area. The provincial submission highlights the process by which awarding demolition permits for inventory-listed homes has a ripple effect that can very quickly lead to there being little left to protect and preserve by the time this plan comes to fruition.

Historic Value

Heritage Regina brought additional information to the meeting about the home, its original owners, and its connection to the history of our province. The details they added suggest the city's assessment underestimated the Bagshaw Residence's heritage value. In addition to learning more about the design details, it was fascinating to learn, for example, that there was once an elected soldier's representative who flew in from the front to sit in the legislature, one of the many stories the Bagshaw Residence tells. It is not unusual for volunteers to at times provide more extensive research than those commissioned to do studies, although community voices are usually given the lesser weight in decision-making. We urge Council to respect the additional information that Heritage Regina brings to the discussion, as studying Regina's history and its historic spaces is the organization's mandate and area of expertise.



Page 2 re. Demolition of the Bagshaw Residence 56 Angus Crescent

Building Condition

The City of Regina's most recent assessment of the home states it is in good condition. A representative of Crawford Homes disputed this, saying it was uninhabitable. Crawford Homes did not provide written documentation, but stated that due to the home's age it "likely" had lead paint inside and mold, presented as if these conditions — assuming their existence — cannot be mitigated, and as if new homes are not also vulnerable to mold. Crawford Homes offered that the home had been uninhabited for some time, though it was unclear for how long it was uninhabited before the current purchase. In any case, it is not the home's interior that is listed as a heritage asset, but the exterior features. It was argued the home overall was beyond structural repair, as one would expect from an owner applying for a demolition permit, being the basis of argument for such a permit. Crawford Homes did not fully articulate its plans for the property, but did say it would include a double car garage and, after some prompting questions by committee members, that a compatible design would be considered, though not one that would include the current building envelope and its unique heritage features. We believe the bar should be higher and that there needs to be more proactive discussion with property developers about how to to renew listed homes and preserve exterior architecture.

Additional Considerations

We note that the Commission's recommendation to allow demolition was not unanimous and that some members of the committee were absent. Therefore, City Council has additional responsibility in its deliberations to ask sharp questions and motivate alternatives.

In our presentation to the Commission, the CACA noted that the City of Regina's Community Plan and Heritage Policy were created at great time and expense to taxpayers. Therefore it behooves city decision-makers to ensure these plans are implemented as intended. It is not as easy as issuing a demolition permit, but it is worth the strongest possible effort, so that words on paper can be actualized in reality.



CATHEDRAL AREA COMMUNITY ASSOCIATION

2900 - 13th Ave, Regina SK, S4T 1N7 • 306.569.8755 • CACA@sasktel.net

July 22, 2020

To: Femi Adegeye, Senior City Planner, City of Regina

AADEGEYE@regina.ca

Re: File No. (56 Angus Crescent)

Dear Mr. Adegeye,

The Cathedral Area Community Association is proud to represent one of the city's most historic neighbourhoods. Our vision statement mandates board members to work with others to "enhance the history, culture and character of the neighbourhood." Therefore, we are pleased to respond to a request for input on the future of the Bagshaw Residence at 56 Angus Crescent, a historic home that has earned a place on the City of Regina's Heritage Inventory.

Among the tens of thousands of buildings in Regina, including over 90,000 private homes, there are just 277 properties listed in the Inventory. These properties are a scarce non-renewable resource of great value to all. This is presumably why the City keeps an inventory, to help ensure the intrinsic and irreplaceable value of historic properties is not overlooked in planning decisions.

A number of inventoried properties are concentrated in our Cathedral neighbourhood, including in the scenic Crescents. These homes make the Crescents attractive to residents and tourists alike. In recent years, the CACA has supported the Cultural Trailway, a project to highlight the history of homes and shops in the neighbourhood with markers and an online walking tour; historic homes are part of our neighbourhood appeal.

The Bagshaw Residence, constructed in 1913, is a prime example of how historic neighbourhood homes are tied to the story of our city and its residents, as well as wider events such as, in this case, Saskatchewan's wartime history. We will not repeat what has been presented to you in the heritage assessment, which makes a clear case for its historic import. The assessment also makes a case for the architectural significance, a Clemesha and Portnall design that is an example of some of the unique personalized residential architecture that defines the Crescents.

Your policy states, "Historic places are integral in providing a sense of identity and place both for tourists and, more importantly, for local citizens." We are very aware of the positive impact to the Cathedral Area. Residents move here to be surrounded by interesting older properties, which do cycle between various states of gradual disrepair, renovation and rejuvenation. Every day we see older properties come alive again with loving care.

Given its significance, the Bagshaw Residence should have this opportunity. At last count there were just 16 listed properties remaining in the Crescents — already too few, never mind losing one more. In fact, we would like to see this list expanded to be more inclusive of diverse histories, rather than slowly diminishing it.

cathedralvillage.org • facebook.com/CathedralAreaCommunityAssociation • @CathedralAreaCA

Regina's Community Plan contains numerous references to heritage preservation throughout the document. The Plan does not stop short at putting properties on a list, but promises to "encourage owners to protect historic ownership through good stewardship" and to "build partnerships and work collaboratively" to protect our city's built heritage.

With this in mind, we recommend the Bagshaw Residence remain on the list and that the promised proactive measures in the Community Plan be instituted with the goal of protecting, preserving and enhancing this property. This course of action will have wider benefit to the historic Crescents streetscape, which is one of the most beautiful and distinctive — yet also increasingly endangered — features of the Cathedral Area and City of Regina. Otherwise, there is little point to having a Heritage Inventory, a heritage policy and a Community Plan that set heritage preservation as a goal.

Thank you.

Brad Olson, CACA President

Bagshaw: 56 Angus Crescent

J. Mah/ E. Jones

We have lived at Angus Crescent for 30 years, and we strongly oppose the proposed demolition of the Bagshaw Residence at 56 Angus Crescent, and its removal from the City of Regina's Heritage holding bylaw list.

We firmly support Heritage Regina, the Cathedral Area Community Association, and the Heritage Conservation Branch of Ministry of Parks, Culture and Sport in their support of the heritage value of the Bagshaw Residence, so rich in Heritage architecture and in the history of Regina citizens the Bagshaws, who contributed to the development of many facets of the City.

Within the Crescents neighbourhood of historic houses, the 1913 Bagshaw Residence is a rare example of the Craftsman Style. In the City's own words, *Overall, the Bagshaw Residence is in fair condition with its form, scale, and massing largely intact.* The maintenance and repair described is the regular upkeep needed, as with with other houses of its age.

High quality craftsmanship, architectural design, and materials should not be thrown away so carelessly. The Regina Planning Commission is betraying our history in its approval of the demolition of this early and rare Craftsman Style example, especially when the City of Regina's own Statement of Significance says: The heritage value of 56 Angus Crescent also resides in its architectural style. The exterior design of this residence is an example of the Craftsman Style, as exhibited in the low-pitched gable roof with its wide overhanging eaves, large single dormer, large porch, wooden double hung windows, and exposed wooden structural elements. 56 Angus Crescent was designed by Frederick Chapman Clemesha of the prominent Regina architectural firm of Clemesha and Portnall, which was renowned for its architectural contribution to the residential fabric of Regina.

The heritage value of the property also resides in its location within the Crescents neighbourhood of Regina, and its contribution to the historical architectural character of the Crescents. The development of the Crescents began before the First World War and continued for the next 30 years. Named for the concentric series of the three semicircular streets that were proposed in the 1883 town-site survey, then further detailed in landscape architect Thomas Mawson's 1913 plan for the City of Regina. The Crescents neighbourhood is a prestigious neighbourhood known for its architectural merit, elmshaded streets and its proximity to the parklands along Wascana Creek.

The demolition of the Bagshaw Residence would mean a great architectural loss for Regina, and would diminish the pleasure of life in The Crescents - this house is included in your own walking tour. Its loss would further diminish the integrity and the visual appeal of this small heritage neighbourhood.

Since the 2013 approval of the Design Regina Official Community Plan to protect and preserve heritage neighbourhoods, we have still seen the demolition several heritage Crescents houses, which has disrupted the visual harmony of the street-scape. Once, all houses were aligned along the Crescent, to create a flowing vista, with

windows at the same height and houses all the same distance from the curb. Now, the architectural rhythm has been disrupted by new houses which are somehow allowed to project beyond the line of existing houses, often dwarfing neighbours and reducing their incoming light. Roof lines are no longer regulated. How has this been allowed to happen? Are there no neighbourhood guidelines to adhere to the structure and materials of an historic neighbourhood?

We love to see the Bagshaw house when we walk downtown - its entrance and windows not like any other along the Crescent. We love to saunter down the alley and come upon the red wooden porch, it makes the Crescents feel like being at the beach - a wonderful small town quality in the middle of the City.

The historic charm of the Bagshaw house cannot be reproduced, but it can be restored! Restoration shows respect for our own history. To name a street after Mr Bagshaw without the Bagshaw residence works to purposefully cut our own history out of our City. This demolition is a short-sighted move.

We feel honoured to have lived in the Portnall house, just down the Crescent, for the last 30 years. We were heart-broken when the house that Francis Portnall built for his sister across the street was torn down without a word about its history and significance. Three further Portnall buildings have been demolished recently in Wascana Park - the former MacKenzie Art Gallery, the CNIB, and now Wascana Pool. We feel architecturally related to the Bagshaw residence through the Clemesha Portnall partnership.

We cannot believe how anyone who cares about Regina's history and its future would buy a house on the Heritage Holding list, only to insist on tearing it down. To come to a historic neighbourhood, only to then proceed to destroy it shows great disrespect for the neighbourhood, the neighbours, and our City's history.

The Regina Planning Commission's Recommendation for demolition goes against Regina's Official Community Plan.

Heritage Regina and CACA have created a series of ceramic plaques to highlight our heritage architecture, and I am the ceramic artist who does the labour. Other cities do this with pride, because they understand the value of heritage architecture.

Regina must begin to see and value its own architecture and beauty and urban planning.

Please do not allow the demolition of the unique and historic Bagshaw House.

Thank you.

Jeannie Mah and Edward Jones